

# IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FIFTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF GOODING

IDAHO GROUND WATER APPROPRIATORS, INC.,	) Case No.: CV-2010-382
Petitioner, vs.	<ul> <li>) (consolidated Gooding County Cases</li> <li>) CV-2010-382, CV-2010-383, CV-</li> <li>) 2010-384, CV-2010-387, CV-2010-</li> <li>) 388, Twin Falls County Cases CV-</li> </ul>
CITY OF POCATELLO,	) 2010-3403, CV-2010-5520, CV-2010- ) 5946, CV-2012-2096, CV-2013-2305,
Petitioner, vs.	) CV-2013-4417 and Lincoln County ) Case CV-2013-155)
TWIN FALLS CANAL COMPANY,	)
NORTH SIDE CANAL COMPANY, A&B IRRIGATION DISTRICT, AMERICAN FALLS RESERVOIR DISTRICT #2, BURLEY IRRIGATION DISTRICT, MILNER IRRIGATION DISTRICT, and MINIDOKA IRRIGATION DISTRICT,	<ul> <li>ORDER DENYING PETITIONS</li> <li>FOR REHEARING</li> </ul>
Petitioners,	)
VS.	)
GARY SPACKMAN, in his capacity as Director of the Idaho Department of Water Resources, and THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES,	) ) ) )
Respondents.	) ) )
IN THE MATTER OF DISTRIBUTION OF WATER TO VARIOUS WATER RIGHTS	) ) )

A&B IRRIGATION DISTRICT,
AMERICAN FALLS RESERVOIR
DISTRICT #2, BURLEY IRRIGATION
DISTRICT, MILNER IRRIGATION
DISTRICT, MINIDOKA IRRIGATION
DISTRICT, NORTH SIDE CANAL
COMPANY AND TWIN FALLS CANAL
COMPANY

()

I.

# **BACKGROUND**

- 1. On September 26, 2014, this Court entered a *Memorandum Decision and Order* and *Judgment* in the above-captioned matter.
- 2. On October 10, 2014, the A&B Irrigation District, American Falls Reservoir District #2, Burley Irrigation District, Milner Irrigation District, Minidoka Irrigation District, North Side Canal Company and Twin Falls Canal (collectively, "Surface Water Coalition") filed a *Joint Petition for Rehearing*. The Surface Water Coalition subsequently filed a *Brief* in support of their *Joint Petition*.
- 3. On October 17, 2014, the Idaho Ground Water Appropriators, Inc. ("IGWA") filed a *Petition for Rehearing*. IGWA subsequently filed a *Brief* in support of its *Petition*.
  - 4. A hearing on both *Petitions* was held before this Court on November 13, 2014.

#### II.

## **ANALYSIS**

Under Idaho Rule of Civil Procedure 84(r) and Idaho Appellate Rule 42 the decision to grant or deny the *Petitions for Rehearing* at issue here is left to the discretion of this Court. In this case, the Court in an exercise of its discretion, and for the reasons set forth herein, denies the *Petitions for Rehearing*.

With respect to the Surface Water Coalition's *Joint Petition for Rehearing*, this Court disagrees that Section V.A.iv of its *Memorandum Decision* constitutes an advisory opinion. The Court finds that its Section V.A.iv analysis is part and parcel with its larger analysis addressing

the legality of Step 8 of the Director's *Methodology Order*. The Surface Water Coalition argued that Step 8 unlawfully provides for out-of-priority water use without remedy of curtailment or a properly enacted mitigation plan. This Court agreed. However, the Coalition's position was not unopposed. In conjunction with its overarching conclusion that step 8 does not comply with Idaho law, the Court, via the inclusion of Section V.A.iv, acknowledged some of the concerns and issues raised by the parties opposing the Coalition's position. Specifically, issues concerning difficulties associated with mid-season curtailments and with the ability of junior users to secure additional water mid-season to mitigate any increased injury to reasonable inseason demand. The Court finds that these issues were placed before the Court and argued by the parties in this judicial review proceeding. Therefore, the Surface Water Coalition's *Petition for Rehearing* is denied.

With respect to IGWA's *Petition for Rehearing*, the Court finds that the issues and arguments set forth therein rehash issues and arguments already raised by IGWA in this judicial review proceeding. The Court considered those issues and arguments in conjunction with the drafting and issuing of its *Memorandum Decision and Order*. Following its review of IGWA's *Petition*, the Court does not find reason or cause to revisit those issues and arguments on rehearing. Therefore, IGWA's *Petition for Rehearing* is denied.

# III.

### ORDER

Therefore, IT IS ORDERED that the *Petitions for Rehearing* filed in the above-captioned matter **are hereby denied**.

Dated November 17, 2014

RIC J. WILDMAN
District Judge

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The term "Methodology Order" refers to the Director's Second Amended Final Order Regarding Methodology for Determining Material Injury to Reasonable In-Season Demand and Reasonable Carryover issued on June 23, 2010.

#### CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that a true and correct copy of the ORDER DENYING PETITIONS FOR REHEARING was mailed on November 17, 2014, with sufficient first-class postage to the following:

CITY OF POCATELLO Represented by: A. DEAN TRANMER CITY OF POCATELLO PO BOX 4169 POCATELLO, ID 83201 Phone: 208-234-6148

GARY SPACKMAN Represented by: GARRICK L BAXTER DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL W KENT FLETCHER STATE OF IDAHO - IDWR PO BOX 83720 BOISE, ID 83720-0098 Phone: 208-287-4800

A&B IRRIGATION DISTICT BURLEY IRRIGATION DISTRICT MILNER IRRIGATION DISTRICT NORTH SIDE CANAL COMPANY TWIN FALLS CANAL COMPANY Represented by: PAUL L ARRINGTON 195 RIVER VISTA PL STE 204 TWIN FALLS, ID 83301-3029 Phone: 208-733-0700

IDAHO GROUND WATERS Represented by: RANDALL C BUDGE 201 E CENTER ST STE A2 PO BOX 1391 POCATELLO, ID 83204-1391 Phone: 208-232-6101

CITY OF POCATELLO Represented by: SARAH A KLAHN WHITE & JANKOWSKI LLP KITTREDGE BUILDING 511 16TH ST STE 500 DENVER, CO 80202 Phone: 303-595-9441

A&B IRRIGATION DISTICT BURLEY IRRIGATION DISTRICT

MILNER IRRIGATION DISTRICT NORTH SIDE CANAL COMPANY TWIN FALLS CANAL COMPANY Represented by: TRAVIS L THOMPSON 195 RIVER VISTA PL STE 204 TWIN FALLS, ID 83301-3029 Phone: 208-733-0700

AMERICAN FALLS RESERVOIR MINIDOKA IRRIGATION DISTRICT Represented by: 1200 OVERLAND AVE PO BOX 248 BURLEY, ID 83318-0248 Phone: 208-678-3250

DIRECTOR OF IDWR PO BOX 83720 BOISE, ID 83720-0098

ORDER

Page 1 11/17/14

/S/ JULIE MURPHY Deputy Clerk