BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES

OF THE STATE OF IDAHO

IN THE MATTER OF DISTRIBUTION OF WATER TO WATER RIGHTS HELD BY MEMBERS OF THE BIG WOOD & LITTLE WOOD WATER USERS ASSOCIATION DIVERTING FROM THE BIG WOOD RIVER

Docket No. CM-DC-2015-001

IN THE MATTER OF DISTRIBUTION OF WATER TO WATER RIGHTS HELD BY MEMBERS OF THE BIG WOOD & LITTLE WOOD WATER USERS ASSOCIATION DIVERTING FROM THE LITTLE WOOD RIVER

Docket No. CM-DC-2015-002

ORDER DENYING SUN VALLEY COMPANY'S MOTION TO MODIFY/WITHDRAW

BACKGROUND

On February 24, 2015, the Director ("Director") of the Idaho Department of Water Resources ("Department") received two conjunctive management water delivery call letters from counsel for members of the Big Wood & Little Wood Water Users Association ("Petitioners"). The letters allege senior surface water users on the Big Wood and Little Wood Rivers are being injured by water users diverting ground water hydraulically connected to the Big Wood and Little Wood Rivers. The letters request the Director regulate junior ground water users consistent with the prior appropriation doctrine.

The Director initiated new contested case proceedings and assigned each delivery call letter its own docket number. The Big Wood Delivery Call was assigned docket no. CM-DC-2015-001. The Little Wood Delivery Call was assigned docket no. CM-DC-2015-002.

On March 20, 2015, the Department sent letters to ground water users the Department identified as potentially affected by one or both of the above-described delivery calls. The purpose of the letters was to inform the water users of the delivery calls and notify them of a planned status conference. The letters invited the water users to file a written notice with the Department if they planned to participate in delivery call proceedings. The Department received over 100 notices of intent to participate, including a notice filed by Sun Valley Company ("SVC").

The Department also published general notice of the delivery calls and the status conference in the Idaho Mountain Express and Camas Courier on March 25th, 2015 & April 1st, 2015; and the Times News on March 26th, 2015 & April 2nd, 2015. The Director held a status conference on May 4, 2015.

On May 20, 2015, the Director sent a letter to counsel for Petitioners, requesting additional information about Petitioners' diversion and use of water ("Letter"). The Letter requested a response to the information request within thirty days.

On June 3, 2015, the Director held a prehearing conference. At the prehearing conference the participants discussed information in the Department's possession and how it might be disseminated to the parties and participants. The Director stated he would request that staff prepare memoranda regarding how water is delivered to the Petitioners. The Director also stated the staff memoranda would summarize relevant hydrologic and hydrogeologic data and information in the possession of the Department. The Director issued a *Request for Staff Memoranda* ("Request") on June 12, 2015.

On July 1, 2015, SVC filed Sun Valley Company's Motion to Modify/Withdraw "Request for Staff Memoranda" and May 20, 2015 "Request for Additional Information" ("Motion to Modify/Withdraw") and the Affidavit of Counsel in Support of Sun Valley Company's Motion to Modify/Withdraw "Request for Staff Memoranda" and May 20, 2015 Request for Additional Information ("Affidavit"). Joinders in support of the Motion to Modify/Withdraw were filed by attorney James P. Speck on behalf of multiple respondents, and the City of Ketchum and City of Fairfield. Water District 37-B Groundwater Group filed a Response to Motion to Modify/Withdraw "Request for Staff Memoranda."

ANALYSIS

1. Staff Memoranda may be Prepared Prior to Hearing

SVC requests the Director withdraw the Request because the Department's Rules of Procedure do not authorize Department staff to prepare staff memoranda in advance of the hearing on the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. *Motion to Modify/Withdraw* at 5-8, 13-14. SVC argues "[t]he proper role of the Department staff in this proceeding, if any, is, upon the Director's request, to evaluate the evidence that has been gathered, compiled, organized, and

¹ SVC characterizes the Letter as the "Department's Discovery Requests." *Motion to Modify/Withdraw* at 2. But as SVC previously recognized, the Letter is distinguishable from a discovery request. *See Opposition to Motion for Protective Order* at 2-3 ("As to the contention that there exists substantial overlap between the information requested by the Department and the written discovery propounded by SVC, it bears noting that the evidentiary value of responses to interrogatories is distinguishable from information that is simply supplied to an agency upon request, in light of the fact that responses to interrogatories and requests for admission both must be verified by the party responding.").

² Attached to the Affidavit is Exhibit A, "an internally-prepared rough transcript of the June 3, 2015, pre-hearing conference." *Affidavit* at 2. The "rough transcript" contains an incorrect attribution. Page seventeen of the "rough transcript" attributes the statement "Because there's no model" to counsel for the Department. Upon review of the audio of the pre-hearing conference, the speaker is not Department's counsel.

³ On April 22, 2015, the Water District 37-B Groundwater Group filed a notice of intent to participate only in proceedings related to the Big Wood Delivery Call. On July 15, 2015, counsel Dylan B. Lawrence, of the law firm Varin Wardwell LLC, filed the *Response to Motion to Modify/Withdraw "Request for Staff Memoranda"* on behalf of the Water District 37-B Groundwater Group in both the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. The Water District 37-B Groundwater Group did not file a notice of intent to participate in the Little Wood Delivery Call in compliance with the Director's May 13, 2015, *Order Governing Participation*. Therefore, the Director will not consider filings by the Water District 37-B Groundwater Group in Little Wood Delivery Call proceedings.

presented by the parties at a hearing and properly admitted, as evidence, into the hearing record by the Director." Id. at 9 (emphasis in original).

SVC ignores the plain language of Rule 602 that states:

Official notice may be taken of any facts that could be judicially noticed in the courts of Idaho and of generally recognized technical or scientific facts within the agency's specialized knowledge. Parties shall be notified of the specific facts or material noticed and the source of the material noticed, including any agency staff memoranda and data. Notice that official notice will be taken should be provided either before or during the hearing, and must be provided before the issuance of any order that is based in whole or in part on facts or material officially noticed. Parties must be given an opportunity to contest and rebut the facts or material officially noticed. When the presiding officer proposes to notice agency staff memoranda or agency staff reports, responsible staff employees or agents shall be made available for cross-examination if any party timely requests their availability.

IDAPA 37.01.01.602 (emphasis added). The plain language of Rule 602 emphasized above expressly authorizes the Director to notify the parties before hearing that official notice will be taken of staff memoranda. In addition, Rule 602's requirement that staff employees responsible for staff memoranda be available for cross-examination at hearing presupposes staff memoranda may be prepared prior to hearing. Rule 602 clearly authorizes preparation of staff memoranda prior to hearing. The Director will not withdraw the Request.

2. The Department may Gather and Disseminate Information Prior to Hearing

SVC requests the Director withdraw the Letter and "require Department staff to immediately cease any information gathering" from Petitioners because the Department's Rule of Procedure 600 does "not contemplate the gathering, compilation, or organization of factual information from the parties by Department staff before that information becomes evidence." *Motion to Modify/Withdraw* at 9-12. In support of this argument, SVC points to Rule 600's statement that: "The agency's experience, technical competence and specialized knowledge may be used in *evaluation of evidence*." IDAPA 37.01.01.600 (emphasis added).

While Rule 600 speaks to the Department's authority to evaluate *evidence*, nothing in Rule 600 precludes the Department from gathering technical and factual information that *may become evidence* admitted into the record at hearing and disseminating that information to the parties prior to hearing for evaluation and potential rebuttal. The Department's Rules of Procedure do not preclude its information gathering efforts in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls.

SVC argues the Department's information gathering efforts may cause staff to develop "bias in favor of the information collected from the Petitioners" that may influence "its eventual 'evaluation of evidence' in accordance with Rule 600" and "preparation of technical memoranda that may be officially noticed under Rule 602." *Motion to Modify/Withdraw* at 9-13. SVC asserts it does not have "a full and fair opportunity to observe and pose legitimate evidentiary objections to the information gathered by Department staff, to ensure completeness and

accuracy." *Id.* at 10. SVC asserts "this one-sided evaluative process is highly prejudicial" and "violates [SVC's] due process rights." *Id.* at 13.

Department efforts to collect and disseminate information about the Petitioners' diversion and use of water and hydrologic and hydrogeologic data to the parties for evaluation and potential rebuttal prior to hearing do not prejudice, but rather assist, all the parties. In addition, as SVC recognizes, the Director alone is responsible for admitting evidence at hearing and deciding what weight to give that evidence in his determination of the ultimate issues to be decided in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. See Motion to Modify/Withdraw at 11. All parties will have full and fair opportunity to examine and object to any information proposed for admission as evidence into the record at hearing. If the Director notifies the parties that official notice will be taken of staff memoranda, responsible staff employees will be available for cross-examination at hearing. The Director will not withdraw the Letter or instruct Department staff to cease information gathering.

ORDER

Based upon and consistent with the foregoing, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Motion to Modify/Withdraw is DENIED.

DATED this 22nd day of July 2015.

GARY SPACKMAN

Director

⁴ If Petitioners submit any information in response to the Letter, the Director will post that information to the websites for the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls that may be accessed from the following website link: http://www.idwr.idaho.gov/legal_actions/.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that, on this 220d day of July 2015, I served a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing document by placing a copy of the same in the United States mail, postage prepaid and properly addressed and by e-mail to participants who have provided e-mail addresses to the Department for service to the following:

BIG WOOD WATER USERS ASSN
LITTLE WOOD WATER USERS ASSN
C/O JOSEPH F. JAMES
BROWN & JAMES
130 FOURTH AVENUE WEST
GOODING ID 83330
joe@brownjameslaw.com
dana@brownjameslaw.com

SOUTH VALLEY GROUNDWATER
DISTRICT
C/O ALBERT BARKER
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
PO BOX 2139
BOISE ID 83701-2139
apb@idahowaters.com
sle@idahowaters.com

HAILEY CEMETERY MAINTENCE DIST JACOB & RUTH BLOOM C/O PATRICK D BROWN PATRICK D BROWN PC PO BOX 125 TWIN FALLS ID 83303 pat@pblaw.co

IDAHO GROUND WATER APPROPRIATORS INC
C/O RANDALL C BUDGE
THOMAS J BUDGE
JOSEPH G BALLSTAEDT
RACINE OLSON
PO BOX 1391
POCATELLO ID 83204-1391
rcb@racinelaw.net
tjb@racinelaw.net
igb@racinelaw.net

CITY OF FAIRFIELD
CITY OF KETCHUM
C/O SUSAN E BUXTON
CHERESE D MCLAIN
MOORE SMITH BUXTON & TURCKE
950 W BANNOCK ST STE 520
BOISE ID 83702
seb@msbtlaw.com
cdm@msbtlaw.com

SINCLAIR OIL CORPORATION DBA SUN VALLEY COMPANY C/O SCOTT L CAMPBELL MATTHEW J MCGEE MOFFATT THOMAS PO BOX 829 BOISE ID 83701-0829 slc@moffatt.com

CITY OF HAILEY
VALLEY CLUB INC
C/O MICHAEL C CREAMER
MICHAEL P LAWRENCE
GIVENS PURLSEY LLP
PO BOX 2720
BOISE ID 83701-2720
mcc@givenspursley.com
mpl@givenspursley.com
lisahughes@givenspursley.com
lorigibson@givenspursley.com

STROM RANCHES INC
DENNIS STROM
C/O S BRYCE FARRIS
SAWTOOTH LAW OFFICES PLLC
PO BOX 7985
BOISE ID 83707-7985
bryce@sawtoothlaw.com

AF 2014 TRUST
GEOFFREY SMITH LLC
MARIANA S PAEN TRUST
C/O FRITZ HAEMMERLE
HAEMMERLE & HAMMERLE PLLC
PO BOX 1800
HAILEY ID 83333
fxh@haemlaw.com

ANIMAL SHELTER OF WOOD RIVER VALLEY DENNIS J CARD & MAUREEN M MCCANTY **EDWARD A LAWSON** FLYING HEART RANCH II SUBDIVISION OWNERS ASSN HELIOS DEVELOPMENT LLC SOUTHERN COMFORT HOMEOWNERS **ASSN** THE VILLAGE GREEN VCHOA C/O JAMES R LASKI HEATHER O'LEARY LAWSON LASKI CLARK & POGUE PLLC PO BOX 3310 KETCHUM ID 83340 heo@lawsonlaski.com jrl@lawsonlaski.com

WATER DISTRICT 37-B GROUNDWATER GROUP C/O DYLAN B LAWRENCE VARIN WARDWELL LLC PO BOX 1676 BOISE ID 83701-1676 dylanlawrence@varinwardwell.com

IDAHO FOUNDATION FOR PARKS AND LANDS INC
C/O CHAS MCDEVITT
MCDEVITT & MILLER LLP
PO BOX 2564
BOISE ID 83701
chas@mcdevitt-miller.com

C/O EILEEN MCDEVITT 732 FALLS VIEW DR TWIN FALLS ID 83301 emcdevitt1@msn.com CITY OF BELLEVUE
MICHELLE WOLF
C/O CANDICE MCHUGH
CHRIS BROMLEY
MCHUGH BROMLEY PLLC
380 S 4TH STREET STE 103
BOISE ID 83702
cmchugh@mchughbromley.com
cbromley@mchughbromley.com

ECCLES FLYING HAT RANCH LLC
ECCLES WINDOW ROCK RANCH LLC
HOLLY FARMS LTD
J EVAN ROBERTSON
SUN VALLEY WATER & SEWER DISTRICT
C/O J EVAN ROBERTSON
ROBERTSON & SLETTE PLLC
PO BOX 1906
TWIN FALLS ID 83303-1906
erobertson@rsidaholaw.com

IDAHO POWER COMPANY
C/O JOHN K SIMPSON
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
PO BOX 2139
BOISE ID 83701-2139
jks@idahowaters.com
jlw@idahowaters.com

AIRPORT WEST BUSINESS PARK OWNERS **ASSN INC AQUARIUS SAW LLC** ASPEN HOLLOW HOMEOWNERS ASSN (ALLAN PATZER & WILLIAM LEHMAN) B LAMBERT TRUST (TOBY B LAMBERT) BARBER FAMILY ASSOCIATES LP **BARRIE FAMILY PARTNERS** BELLEUE FARMS LANDOWNERS ASSN **INC BLAINE COUNTY RECREATION DISTRICT** BLAINE COUNTY SCHOOL DIST NO. 61 CAROL BURDZY THIELEN CHANEY CREEK RANCH LLC **CHARLES & COLLEEN WEAVER** CHARLES L MATTHIESEN CLEAR CREEK LLC CLIFFSIDE HOMEOWNERS ASSN INC COMMUNITY SCHOOL (JANELL L GODDARD) DAN S FAIRMAN MD & MELYNDA KIM STANDLEE FAIRMAN DEER CREEK FARM (LYNN CAMPION) DON R & JUDY H ATKINSON DONNA F TUTTLE TRUST ELIZABETH K GRAY F ALFREDO REGO FLOWERS BENCH LLC GOLDEN EAGLE RANCH HOA INC GREENHORN HOMEOWNERS ASSN (JEFFREY T SEELY) GRIFFIN RANCH PUD SUBDIVISION HOA (CHERI HICKS) **GRIFFIN RANCH SUBDIVISION HOA** (CHERI HICKS) GULCH TRUST (TERESA L MASON) HEATHERLANDS HOMEOWNERS ASSN **HENRY & JANNE BURDICK IDAHO RANCH LLC** JAMES K & SANDRA FIGGE JAMES P & JOAN CONGER KIRIL SOKOLOFF LAURA L LUCERE LINDA WOODCOCK LOUISA JANE H JUDGE MARGO PECK MARION R & ROBERT M ROSENTHAL MATS & SONYA WILANDER MICHAEL E WILLARD MID-VALLEY WATER CO LLC PIONEER RESIDENTIAL & RECREATIONAL PROPERTIES LLC R THOMAS GOODRICH & REBECCA LEA

PATTON

RALPH R LAPHAM RED CLIFFS HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION REDCLIFF PARTNERS LP (RANNEY E DRAPER) RHYTHM RANCH HOMEOWNERS ASSN RIVER ROCK RANCH LP (SHEILA WITMER) ROBERT ROHE SAGEWILLOW LLC SALIGAO LLC SANDOR & TERI SZOMBATHY SCI PROPERTIES LLC (BRENDA A LEVINE) STARLITE HOMEOWNERS ASSN STONEGATE HOMEOWNERS ASSN LLC THE ANNE L WINGATE TRUST THE BARKER LIVING TRUST THE DANIEL T MONOOGIAN REVOCABLE **TRUST** THE JONES TRUST THE RALPH W & KANDI L GIRTON 1999 REVOCABLE TRUST THE RESTATED MCMAHAN 1986 REVOCABLE TRUST THE VERNOY IRREVOCABLE TRUST THOMAS W WEISEL TIMBERVIEW TERRACE HOA INC WEBB LANDSCAPE INC (MARK PALMER) C/O JAMES P SPECK SPECK & AANESTAD PO BOX 987 KETCHUM ID 83340 jim@speckandaanestad.com

DEAN R ROGERS INC (DEAN R ROGERS III)
C/O LAIRD B STONE
STEPHAN KVANVIG STONE & TRAINOR
PO BOX 83
TWIN FALLS ID 83303-0083
sks&t@idaho-law.com

CATHERINE S DAWSON REVOCABLE
TRUST
DEER CREEK RANCH INC
ROBERT L BAKER REVOCABLE TRUST
SYRINGA RANCH LLC
C/O TRAVIS L THOMPSON
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
195 RIVER VISTA PL STE 204
TWIN FALLS ID 83301-3029
tlt@idahowaters.com

ANTHONY & JUDY D ANGELO PO BOX 3267 KETCHUM ID 83340 judydangelore@gmail.com

BARBARA CALL PO BOX 4 ROSS CA 94957 barbcall@sbcglobal.net

BERNARD I FRIEDLANDER PHD 116 VALLEY CLUB DRIVE HAILEY ID 83333

BLUEGROUSE RIDGE HOA C/O BRIAN MCCOY PO BOX 3510 KETCHUM ID 83340 brian@seabrd.net

BRIAN L SMITH & DIANE STEFFEY-SMITH PO BOX 629 BELLEVUE ID 83313 brianlamarsmith@me.com

BRITTA S HUBBARD PO BOX 1167 KETCHUM ID 83340 brittahubbard@gmail.com

BRUCE & KAREN TRUXAL PO BOX 431 BELLEVUE ID 83313 btruxal@powereng.com

CANADIAN CLUB HOMEOWNERS ASSN PO BOX 4041 KETCHUM ID 83340

COLD SPRINGS WATER COMPANY PO BOX 254 KETCHUM ID 83340 DAVID BERMAN PO BOX 1738 CAVE CREEK AZ 85327 berman.dlb@gmail.com

DOUGLAS C WALTON DIANA L WHITING 109 RIVER GROVE LN HAILEY ID 83333

ERNEST & JUDITH GETTO TRUST ERNEST J GETTO 417 ENNISBROOK DR SANTA BARBARA CA 93108

GARY HOFFMAN PO BOX 1529 KETCHUM ID 83340

GREGORY R BLOOMFIELD REVOCABLE TRUST PO BOX 757 HAILEY ID 83333

HARRY S RINKER 949 SOUTH COAST DR STE 500 COSTA MESA CA 92626 hrinker@rinkercompany.com

HARRY S RINKER PO BOX 7250 NEWPORT BEACH CA 92658 toni@rinkercompany.com

HULEN MEADOWS WATER COMPANY AND ASSN INC PO BOX 254 KETCHUM ID 83340

INNOVATIVE MITIGATION SOLUTIONS LLC 2918 N EL RANCHO PL BOISE ID 83704 JAMES D WHITE PO BOX 367 BELLEVUE ID 83313 jdwhite@q.com

JARED R WILLIAMS REVOCABLE TRUST PO BOX 99658 SEATTLE WA 98139

JIM W KOONCE PO BOX 2015 HAILEY ID 83333

KATHERINE BRECKENRIDGE B BAR B INC PO BOX 685 PICABO ID 83348

KEN SANGHA ASAM TRUST PO BOX 9200 KETCHUM ID 83340 kensangha@gmail.com

KEVIN D LAKEY WATER DISTRICT 37 107 W 1ST SHOSHONE ID 83352 watermanager@cableone.net

LAWRENCE SCHOEN 18351 US HWY 20 BELLEVUE ID 83313

LUBOFF SENAVSKY &
CHARLES TIMOTHY FLOYD
PO BOX 1240
EAGLE ID 83616
bsfloyd@mac.com

MARLYS J SCHMIDT 10901 HWY 75 BELLEVUE ID 83313 mjschmidt49@msn.com NANCIE C TATUM & THOMAS F HENNIG PO BOX 1365 SUN VALLEY ID 83353

PAUL & POLLY CARNEY LLOYD & DEANN RICHINS MARK & SUSAN WILLIAMS FISH CREEK RESERVOIR RANCH, LLC 384 2 2900 E PAUL ID 83347

PAUL & TANA DEAN 40 FREEDOM LOOP BELLEVUE ID 83313

PETER ZACH SEWELL LORI SEWELL PO BOX 3175 HAILEY ID 83333 zlsewell@gmail.com

PHILIP J VANDERHOEF KATHLEEN MCKAY 5069 HAROLD PL NE SEATTLE WA 98105

POPPY ENGLEHARDT 10965 HIGHWAY 75 BELLEVUE ID 83313

ROBERT BOUTTIER PO BOX 476 BELLEVUE ID 83313

ROBERT & JUDITH PITTMAN 121 LOWER BROADFORD RD BELLEVUE ID 83313

ROBERT J STRUTHERS 762 ROBERT ST PICABO ROUTE BELLEVUE ID 83313 RUSTY KRAMER
WATER DISTRICT 37B
PO BOX 591
FAIRFIELD ID 83327
waterdistrict37b@outlook.com

SAGE SPRINGS HOMEOWNERS ASSN INC PO BOX 254 KETCHUM ID 83340

SILVER SAGE OWNERS ASSN INC C/O CAROL'S BOOKKEEPING PO BOX 1702 KETCHUM ID 83340

STARWEATHER OWNERS ASSN INC PO BOX 254 KETCHUM ID 83340

STEVEN C FUNK 90 FREEDOM LOOP BELLEVUE ID 83313

SV RANCH LLC PO BOX 333 FAIRFIELD ID 83327 camascreek@hughes.net THOMAS & AMY MISTICK 149 ASPEN LAKES DR HAILEY ID 83333

USDA FOREST SERVICE ATTN JAMIE GOUGH 324 25TH ST OGDEN UT 84401 jgough@fs.fed.us

VALLEY CLUB OWNERS ASSN INC PO BOX 254 KETCHUM ID 83340

WILLIAM R & KATHRYN L RATLIFFE 206 BAYHORSE RD BELLEVUE ID 83313

WOOD RIVER LAND TRUST 119 E BULLION ST HAILEY ID 83333

COURTESEY COPY TO:

ED REAGAN COURIER NEWS PO BOX 339 FAIRFIELD ID 83327 news@highway46.org

Emalee Rushing
Administrative Assistant