BACKGROUND

On February 24, 2015, the Director (“Director”) of the Idaho Department of Water Resources (“Department”) received two conjunctive management water delivery call letters from counsel for members of the Big Wood & Little Wood Water Users Association (“Petitioners”). The letters allege senior surface water users on the Big Wood and Little Wood Rivers are being injured by water users diverting ground water hydraulically connected to the Big Wood and Little Wood Rivers. The letters request the Director regulate junior ground water users consistent with the prior appropriation doctrine.

The Director initiated new contested case proceedings and assigned each delivery call letter its own docket number. The Big Wood Delivery Call was assigned docket no. CM-DC-2015-001. The Little Wood Delivery Call was assigned docket no. CM-DC-2015-002.

On March 20, 2015, the Department sent letters to ground water users the Department identified as potentially affected by one or both of the above-described delivery calls. The purpose of the letters was to inform the water users of the delivery calls and notify them of a planned status conference. The letters invited the water users to file a written notice with the Department if they planned to participate in delivery call proceedings. The Department received over 100 notices of intent to participate, including notices filed by the City of Hailey and the City of Bellevue (“Hailey and Bellevue”).

The Department also published general notice of the delivery calls and the status conference in the Idaho Mountain Express and Camas Courier on March 25th, 2015 & April 1st, 2015; and the Times News on March 26th, 2015 & April 2nd, 2015. The Director held a status conference on May 4, 2015.
On May 20, 2015, the Director sent a letter to counsel for Petitioners, requesting additional information about Petitioners’ diversion and use of water (“Letter”). The Letter requested a response to the information request within thirty days.

On June 3, 2015, the Director held a prehearing conference. At the prehearing conference the participants discussed information in the Department’s possession and how it might be disseminated to the parties and participants. The Director stated he would request that staff prepare memoranda regarding how water is delivered to the Petitioners. The Director also stated the staff memoranda would summarize relevant hydrologic and hydrogeologic data and information in the possession of the Department. The Director issued a Request for Staff Memoranda (“Request”) on June 12, 2015.

On June 26, 2015, Hailey and Bellevue filed a Joint Motion to Modify Request for Staff Memoranda (“Motion to Modify”). Joinders in support of the Motion to Modify were filed by attorney James P. Speck on behalf of multiple respondents, and the City of Ketchum and City of Fairfield.

ANALYSIS

Hailey and Bellevue ask the Director to modify the Request in three ways. Each will be addressed below.

1) Modify the Request to Prohibit Department Staff from Determining Issues that Must be Decided by the Director

Hailey and Bellevue argue the “Request asks [Department] staff to evaluate an incomplete record and make determinations” of factors set forth in CM Rule 42 that must instead be decided by the Director. Motion to Modify at 3. Specifically, Hailey and Bellevue reference the Director’s request that staff prepare “[a] conceptual description of the interaction between ground water and surface water in the Camas Creek drainage, the Big Wood River drainage, the Silver Creek drainage, the Little Wood River drainage, and any other hydrologic units that may be hydraulically connected to the ground water and surface water in the larger Big Wood River and Little Wood River basins.” Id. at 3-4. Hailey and Bellevue also reference the Director’s request that Department staff prepare memoranda describing Petitioners’ source of water supply; delivery systems; physical delivery and water application works; and hydrology, hydrogeology, and hydrologic data, methods, or tools. Id. at 4. Hailey and Bellevue argue it would be “fundamentally unfair” and “unduly prejudice the parties” if the Department prepares staff memoranda describing such information before “all potentially affected parties” have the opportunity to present their own evidence regarding the topics. Id. at 4-5.

The Request does not ask Department staff to opine regarding factors set forth in CM Rule 42 that are “[f]actors the Director may consider in determining whether the holders of water rights are suffering material injury and using water efficiently and without waste.” IDAPA 37.03.11.042.01 (emphasis added). As Hailey and Bellevue acknowledge, the Director alone is

---

1 The term “CM Rule” refers to the Department’s Rules for Conjunctive Management of Surface and Ground Water Resources. IDAPA 37.03.11.
responsible for “evaluating evidence, finding facts, drawing conclusions, and ultimately making determinations concerning the Rule 42 factors and other issues that will be decided” in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. Motion to Modify at 5. The Request only asks Department staff to prepare memoranda that will supply the parties with technical and scientific information within the Department’s specialized knowledge and give the parties an opportunity to evaluate and potentially rebut the information. The Request will not prejudice, but rather benefit, parties in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. There is no need for the Director to modify the Request to “prohibit staff from evaluating information or making determinations of the Rule 42 factors” and other issues the Director will decide in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls.

2) Modify the Request to Delay Issuance of Staff Memoranda or Prohibit Staff From Examining Information Submitted in Response to the Letter

Hailey and Bellevue ask the Director to “modify the Request to delay issuance of any staff memoranda until junior-priority ground water users have been given a meaningful opportunity to submit their own information to [the Department] for consideration” or to “prohibit [Department] staff from examining information submitted by Petitioners” in response to the Letter. Motion to Modify at 7. Hailey and Bellevue argue that allowing Department staff to review information submitted by Petitioners “without also having information from junior-priority ground water users, will unduly prejudice Bellevue and Hailey’s due process rights.” Id. at 6-7.

As discussed above, the Letter only requests additional information about Petitioners’ diversion and use of water. This information may be relevant to the portion of the Request that asks Department staff to prepare a memorandum regarding Petitioners’ surface water delivery systems. See Request at 3. Allowing Department staff to review information submitted by Petitioners prior to submittal of the staff memoranda at issue in the Request will not prejudice, but rather benefit, parties in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. The parties may review, analyze, and offer any rebuttal to information presented in the staff memoranda. The parties will have full and fair opportunity to cross examine staff participating in writing staff memoranda at hearing. The Director will not modify the Request to delay issuance of staff memoranda or prohibit staff from examining information submitted in response to the Letter.2

3) Strike Language from the Request

Hailey and Bellevue request that “the Director remove topics 1, 2, and 5 from the Request because they ask staff to address the type of information that the Director may use to develop an area of common ground water supply (“ACGWS”)” that Hailey and Bellevue argue “should be developed within the ACGWS rulemaking process” rather than in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Call proceedings. Motion to Amend at 8.

The Director is not required to initiate rulemaking to designate an ACGWS prior to responding to the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. See Order Denying Joint Motion to

---

2 If Petitioners submit any information in response to the Letter, the Director will post that information to the websites for the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls that may be accessed from the following website link: http://www.idwr.idaho.gov/legal_actions/.
Designate ACGWS by Rulemaking and to Dismiss Delivery Calls. Therefore, the Director will not remove topics 1, 2, or 5 from the Request.

Hailey and Bellevue ask the Director to strike additional language from the Request. Specifically, Hailey and Bellevue point to the Director’s request “that Department staff review data and information in possession of the Department, and prepare staff memoranda reading [the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls], which could include, without limitation . . . .” Request at 2 (emphasis added). Hailey and Bellevue also point to the Director’s request that staff describe “Information about each calling party’s physical delivery and water application works, including: [items (a)-(e)]; and (f) any other relevant information.” Request at 3 (emphasis added). Hailey and Bellevue argue the above-quoted and emphasized language is too “open-ended” and “could lead [Department] staff to opine on CM Rule 42 factors.” Motion to Modify at 9.

Again, the Request does not ask Department staff to opine regarding factors set forth in CM Rule 42 that are “[f]actors the Director may consider in determining whether the holders of water rights are suffering material injury and using water efficiently and without waste.” IDAPA 37.03.11.042.01 (emphasis added). The Director alone is responsible for evaluating evidence, finding facts, drawing conclusions, and ultimately making determinations concerning CM Rule 42 factors and other issues that will be decided in the Big and Little Wood Delivery Calls. The Director will not modify the Request.

ORDER

Based upon and consistent with the foregoing, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Motion to Modify is DENIED.

DATED this 22nd day of July 2015.

GARY SPACKMAN
Director
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that, on this 22nd day of July 2015, I served a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing document by placing a copy of the same in the United States mail, postage prepaid and properly addressed and by e-mail to participants who have provided e-mail addresses to the Department for service to the following:

BIG WOOD WATER USERS ASSN
LITTLE WOOD WATER USERS ASSN
C/O JOSEPH F. JAMES
BROWN & JAMES
130 FOURTH AVENUE WEST
GOODING ID 83330
joe@brownjameslaw.com
dana@brownjameslaw.com

SOUTH VALLEY GROUNDWATER DISTRICT
C/O ALBERT BARKER
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
PO BOX 2139
BOISE ID 83701-2139
apb@idahowaters.com
sle@idahowaters.com

HAILEY CEMETERY MAINTENCE DIST
JACOB & RUTH BLOOM
C/O PATRICK D BROWN
PATRICK D BROWN PC
PO BOX 125
TWIN FALLS ID 83303
pat@pblaw.co

IDAHO GROUND WATER APPROPRIATORS INC
C/O RANDALL C BUDGE
THOMAS J BUDGE
JOSEPH G BALLSTAEDT
RACINE OLSON
PO BOX 1391
POCATELLO ID 83204-1391
rcb@racinelaw.net
tlb@racinelaw.net
jgb@racinelaw.net

CITY OF FAIRFIELD
CITY OF KETCHUM
C/O SUSAN E BUXTON
CHERESE D MCLAIN
MOORE SMITH BUXTON & TURCKE
950 W BANNOCK ST STE 520
BOISE ID 83702
sdb@msbtlaw.com
cdm@msbtlaw.com

SINCLAIR OIL CORPORATION DBA SUN VALLEY COMPANY
C/O SCOTT L CAMPBELL
MATTHEW J MCGEE
MOFFATT THOMAS
PO BOX 829
BOISE ID 83701-0829
sle@moffatt.com

CITY OF HAILEY VALLEY CLUB INC
C/O MICHAEL C CREAMER
MICHAEL P LAWRENCE
GIVENS PURLEASE LLP
PO BOX 2720
BOISE ID 83701-2720
mcc@givenspursley.com
mpl@givenspursley.com
lisa@givenspursley.com
lorigibson@givenspursley.com

STROM RANCHES INC
DENNIS STROM
C/O S BRYCE FARRIS
SAWTOOTH LAW OFFICES PLLC
PO BOX 7985
BOISE ID 83707-7985
bryce@awtoothlaw.com
AF 2014 TRUST
GEOFFREY SMITH LLC
MARIANA S PAEN TRUST
C/O FRITZ HAEEMERLE
HAEMMERLE & HAMMERLE PLLC
PO BOX 1800
HAILEY ID 83333
fxh@haemlaw.com

ANIMAL SHELTER OF WOOD RIVER VALLEY
DENNIS J CARD & MAUREEN M MCCANTY
EDWARD A LAWSON
FLYING HEART RANCH II SUBDIVISION OWNERS ASSN
HELIOS DEVELOPMENT LLC
SOUTHERN COMFORT HOMEOWNERS ASSN
THE VILLAGE GREEN VCHOA
C/O JAMES R LASKI
HEATHER O'LEARY
LAWSON LASKI CLARK & POGUE PLLC
PO BOX 3310
KETCHUM ID 83340
heo@lawsonlaski.com
jrl@lawsonlaski.com

WATER DISTRICT 37-B GROUNDWATER GROUP
C/O DYLAN B LAWRENCE
VARIN WARDWELL LLC
PO BOX 1676
BOISE ID 83701-1676
dylanlawrence@varinwardwell.com

IDAHO FOUNDATION FOR PARKS AND LANDS INC
C/O CHAS MCDEVITT
MCDEVITT & MILLER LLP
PO BOX 2564
BOISE ID 83701
chas@mcdevitt-miller.com
C/O EILEEN MCDEVITT
732 FALLS VIEW DR
TWIN FALLS ID 83301
emcdevittl@msn.com

CITY OF BELLEVUE
MICHELLE WOLF
C/O CANDICE MCHUGH
CHRIS BROMLEY
MCHUGH BROMLEY PLLC
380 S 4TH STREET STE 103
BOISE ID 83702
cmchugh@mchughbromley.com
cbromley@mchughbromley.com

ECCLES FLYING HAT RANCH LLC
ECCLES WINDOW ROCK RANCH LLC
HOLLY FARMS LTD
J EVAN ROBERTSON
SUN VALLEY WATER & SEWER DISTRICT
C/O J EVAN ROBERTSON
ROBERTSON & SLETTE PLLC
PO BOX 1906
TWIN FALLS ID 83303-1906
erobertson@rsidaholaw.com

IDAHO POWER COMPANY
C/O JOHN K SIMPSON
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
PO BOX 2139
BOISE ID 83701-2139
jks@idahowaters.com
jlw@idahowaters.com
AIRPORT WEST BUSINESS PARK OWNERS ASSN INC
AQUARIUS SAW LLC
ASPEN HOLLOW HOMEOWNERS ASSN (ALLAN PATZER & WILLIAM LEHMAN)
B LAMBERT TRUST (TOBY B LAMBERT)
BARBER FAMILY ASSOCIATES LP
BARRIE FAMILY PARTNERS
BELLEUE FARMS LANDOWNERS ASSN INC
BLAINE COUNTY RECREATION DISTRICT
BLAINE COUNTY SCHOOL DIST NO. 61
CAROL BURDZY THIELEN
CHANNEY CREEK RANCH LLC
CHARLES & COLLEEN WEAVER
CHARLES L MATTHIESEN
CLEAR CREEK LLC
CLIFFSIDE HOMEOWNERS ASSN INC
COMMUNITY SCHOOL (JANELL L GODDARD)
DAN S FAIRMAN MD & MELYNDA KIM STANDLEE FAIRMAN
DEER CREEK FARM (LYNN CAMPION)
DON R & JUDY H ATKINSON
DONNA F TUTTLE TRUST
ELIZABETH K GRAY
F ALFREDO REGO
FLOWERS BENCH LLC
GOLDEN EAGLE RANCH HOA INC
GREENHORN HOMEOWNERS ASSN (JEFFREY T SEELY)
GRIFFIN RANCH PUD SUBDIVISION HOA (CHERI HICKS)
GRIFFIN RANCH SUBDIVISION HOA (CHERI HICKS)
GULCH TRUST (TERESA L MASON)
HEATHERLANDS HOMEOWNERS ASSN
HENRY & JANNE BURDICK
IDAHO RANCH LLC
JAMES K & SANDRA FIGGE
JAMES P & JOAN CONGER
KIRIL SOKOLOFF
LAURA L LUCERE
LINDA WOODCOCK
LOUISA JANE H JUDGE
MARGO PECK
MARION R & ROBERT M ROSENTHAL
MATS & SONYA WILANDER
MICHAEL E WILLARD
MID-VALLEY WATER CO LLC
PIONEER RESIDENTIAL & RECREATIONAL PROPERTIES LLC
R THOMAS GOODRICH & REBECCA LEA PATTON
RALPH R LAPHAM
RED CLIFFS HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION
REDCLIFF PARTNERS LP (RANNEY E DRAPER)
RHYTHM RANCH HOMEOWNERS ASSN
RIVER ROCK RANCH LP (SHEILA WITMER)
ROBERT ROHE
SAGEWILLOW LLC
SALIGAO LLC
SANDOR & TERI SZOMBATHY
SCI PROPERTIES LLC (BRENDA A LEVINE)
STARLITE HOMEOWNERS ASSN
STONEGATE HOMEOWNERS ASSN LLC
THE ANNE L WINGATE TRUST
THE BARKER LIVING TRUST
THE DANIEL T MONOOGIAN REVOCABLE TRUST
THE JONES TRUST
THE RALPH W & KANDI L GIRTON 1999 REVOCABLE TRUST
THE RESTATED MCMAHAN 1986 REVOCABLE TRUST
THE VERNOY IRREVOCABLE TRUST
THOMAS W WEISEL
TIMBERVIEW TERRACE HOA INC
WEBB LANDSCAPE INC (MARK PALMER)
C/O JAMES P SPECK
SPECK & AANESTAD
PO BOX 987
KETCHUM ID 83340
jim@speckandaanestad.com
DEAN R ROGERS INC (DEAN R ROGERS III)
C/O LAIRD B STONE
STEPHAN KVANVIG STONE & TRAINOR
PO BOX 83
TWIN FALLS ID 83303-0083
sks&t@idaho-law.com
CATHERINE S DAWSON REVOCABLE TRUST
DEER CREEK RANCH INC
ROBERT L BAKER REVOCABLE TRUST
SYRINGA RANCH LLC
C/O TRAVIS L THOMPSON
BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
195 RIVER VISTA PL STE 204
TWIN FALLS ID 83301-3029
tlt@idahowaters.com