A. Dean Tranmer (ISB # 2793) City of Pocatello P. O. Box 4169 Pocatello, ID 83201 (208) 234-6149 (208) 239-6986 (Fax) dtranmer@pocatello.us

Sarah A. Klahn (ISB # 7928) Mitra M. Pemberton J. Ryland Hutchins White & Jankowski, LLP 511 Sixteenth Street, Suite w500 Denver, CO 80202 (303) 595-9441 (303) 825-5632 (Fax) sarahk@white-jankowski.com

ATTORNEYS FOR CITY OF POCATELLO

BEFORE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES OF THE STATE OF IDAHO

IN THE MATTER OF DISTRIBUTION)	Docket No. CM-DC-2011-004
OF WATER TO WATER RIGHT NOS.)	
36-02551 AND 36-07694)	CITY OF POCATELLO'S MOTION IN
)	LIMINE TO PRECLUDE RANGEN, INC.
(RANGEN, INC.))	FROM OFFERING TESTIMONY OR
	_)	EVIDENCE IN RESPONSE TO THE IDWR
		STAFF MEMORANDUM

City of Pocatello ("Pocatello"), by and through undersigned counsel, hereby moves the Director of the Idaho Department of Water Resources ("IDWR") to enter an Order pursuant to IDAPA 37.01.01.600 prohibiting Rangen, Inc. ("Rangen") from offering testimony or evidence in response to IDWR's Staff Memorandum in Response to Expert Reports Submitted for the Rangen Delivery Call ("Staff Memorandum") and as grounds for states:

ARGUMENT

On February 27, 2013 IDWR staff filed its Staff Memorandum which summarized and responded to the expert reports in this case. The parties were required to file their responses to the Staff Memorandum by April 5, 2013. Fifth Amended Scheduling Order, Mar. 20, 2013. Instead, on April 5, 2013 Rangen filed a "Notice of No Written Response to Staff Memorandum." Given the presence of the qualifier "written" in Rangen's notice, City of Pocatello is concerned that Rangen's failure to file a response to the Staff Memorandum could be an attempt to put on live testimony at the hearing regarding IDWR's Staff Memorandum. Pocatello requests that the Director exclude such testimony for the reasons described below.

If Rangen were to present new evidence in response to the Staff Memorandum at trial, Pocatello, and other junior water users in this matter would be unfairly prejudiced. Granting this Motion will not result in prejudice to Rangen because it had an opportunity to file a report responding to the Staff Memorandum, yet chose not to. However, if Rangen were allowed to put on responsive evidence regarding the Staff Memorandum, Pocatello and other juniors will almost certainly be prejudiced by an inability to adequately defend against such evidence. The Director should use his broad discretion to prevent this potential prejudice from occurring. *Puckett v. Verska*, 144 Idaho 161, 167, 158 P.3d 937, 943 (2007) ("Trial courts have broad discretion when ruling on a motion in limine"); *see also Perry v. Magic Valley Reg'l Med. Ctr.*, 134 Idaho 46, 52–53, 995 P.2d 816, 822–23 (2000) (upholding trial court's exclusion of "ambush" evidence not disclosed prior to trial).

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

For the foregoing reasons, Pocatello respectfully requests that the Director enter an Order prohibiting Rangen from putting on any new testimony or evidence which responds to the IDWR Staff Memorandum at the hearing in this matter.

Respectfully submitted this 25th day of April, 2013.

CITY OF POCATELLO ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

A Doon Tronmon

WHITE & JANKOWSKI

 $_{\rm By}$ \sim

J. Ryland Hutchins

ATTORNEYS FOR CITY OF POCATELLO

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 25TH day of April, 2013, I caused to be served a true and correct copy of the foregoing City of Pocatello's Motion in Limine to Preclude Rangen, Inc. from Offering Testimony or Evidence in Response to the IDWR Staff Memorandum for Docket No. CM-DC-2011-004 upon the following by the method indicated:

Sarah Klahn, White & Jankowski, LLP

Gary Spackman, Director	X Original sent via U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
State of Idaho, Dept of Water Resources	Hand Delivery
322 E Front St	Overnight Mail – Federal Express
PO Box 83720	Facsimile - 208-287-6700 = Phone - 208-287-4803
Boise ID 83720-0098	X Email
deborah.gibson@idwr.idaho.gov	
dobbiangioon(6)ta windanoigo v	
J. Justin May	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
May Browning	Hand Delivery
1419 W Washington	Overnight Mail
Boise ID 83702	Facsimile – 208-342-7278
jmay@maybrowning.com	X Email
J	
Robyn Brody	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
Brody Law Office	Hand Delivery
PO Box 554	Overnight Mail
Rupert ID 83350	Facsimile - 208-434-2780 = Phone 208-434-2778
robynbrody@hotmail.com	X Email
,	
Fritz Haemmerle	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
Haemmerle Haemmerle	Hand Delivery
PO Box 1800	Overnight Mail
Hailey ID 83333	Facsimile - 208-578-0564
fxh@haemlaw.com	X Email
	<u> </u>
Garrick L. Baxter	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
Chris M. Bromley	Hand Delivery
Deputy Attorneys General – IDWR	Overnight Mail
PO Box 83720	Facsimile - 208-287-6700
Boise ID 83720-0098	X Email
garrick.baxter@idwr.idaho.gov	-X Dilui
chris.bromley@idwr.idaho.gov	
kimi.white@idwr.idaho.gov	
Killi. wille(ta)idwiidailo.gov	
Randall C. Budge	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
Candice M. McHugh	Hand Delivery
Racine Olson Nye Budge & Bailey	Overnight Mail
101 S Capitol Blvd Ste 300	Facsimile – 208-433-0167
Boise ID 83702	X Email
rcb@racinelaw.net	
cmm@racinelaw.net	
bjh@racinelaw.net	
Olitharaciticia w. Het	
Dean Tranmer	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid
City of Pocatello	Hand Delivery
PO Box 4169	Overnight Mail
Pocatello ID 83201	Facsimile – 208-234-6297
dtranmer@pocatello.us	X Email
and the production of the prod	

C. Thomas Arkoosh Arkoosh Law Offices PO Box 2900 Boise ID 83701 tom.arkoosh@arkoosh.com erin.cecil@arkoosh.com	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid Hand Delivery Overnight Mail Facsimile 208-343-5456X Email
John K. Simpson Travis L. Thompson Paul L. Arrington Barker Rosholt & Simpson 195 River Vista Place Ste 204 Twin Falls ID 83301-3029 tlt@idahowaters.com jks@idahowaters.com pla@idahowaters.com jf@idahowaters.com	U.S. Mail, Postage PrepaidHand DeliveryOvernight MailFacsimile 208-735-2444X_Email
W. Kent Fletcher Fletcher Law Office PO Box 248 Burley, ID 83318 wkf@pmt.org	U.S. Mail, Postage PrepaidHand DeliveryOvernight MailFacsimile 208-878-2548X_Email
Jerry R. Rigby Hyrum Erickson Robert H Wood Rigby Andrus & Rigby PO Box 250 Rexburg ID 83440-0250 jrigby@rex-law.com herickson@rex-law.com rwood@rex-law.com	U.S. Mail, Postage Prepaid Hand Delivery Overnight Mail Facsimile 208-356-0768 Email