

Albert P. Barker [ISB No. 2867]  
Travis L. Thompson [ISB No. 6168]  
Michael A. Short [ISB No. 10554]  
**BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP**  
1010 W. Jefferson St., Ste. 102  
PO Box 2139  
Boise, ID 83701-2139  
Telephone: (208) 336-07000  
Facsimile: (208) 344-6034

James R. Laski, ISB No. 5429  
Heather E. O’Leary, ISB No. 8693  
LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC  
675 Sun Valley Road, Suite A  
Post Office Box 3310  
Ketchum, Idaho 83340  
Telephone 208.725.0055  
Facsimile 208.725.0076  
[jrl@lawsonlaski.com](mailto:jrl@lawsonlaski.com)  
[heo@lawsonlaski.com](mailto:heo@lawsonlaski.com)  
[efiling@lawsonlaski.com](mailto:efiling@lawsonlaski.com)

*Attorneys for South Valley Ground Water District and Galena Ground Water District*

**BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES  
OF THE STATE OF IDAHO**

IN THE MATTER OF BASIN 37  
ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDING

Docket No. AA-WRA-2021-001

**SOUTH VALLEY GROUND  
WATER DISTRICT’S AND  
GALENA GROUND WATER  
DISTRICT’S OBJECTION TO  
NOTICE OF TAKING  
DEPOSITION DUCES TECUM OF  
DAVID B. SHAW**

COMES NOW, the SOUTH VALLEY GROUND WATER DISTRICT (“SVGWD”) by and through its attorneys of record, BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP and THE GALENA GROUND WATER DISTRICT (“Galena GWD”) by and through its attorneys of record,  
**OBJECTION TO NOTICE OF DEPOSITION DUCES TECUM ON DAVID B. SHAW**

LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC, pursuant to Rule 521 of the Rules of Procedure of the Idaho Department of Water Resources (“IDWR”), Idaho Rule of Procedure 26(b), the May 21, 2021 *Order Authorizing Discovery*, and the May 25, 2021 *Prehearing Order; Scheduling Order*, and hereby object to the proposed scope of the Big Wood and Little Wood Water Users Association (“BWLWWUA”) and the Big Wood Canal Company’s (“BWCC”) *Notice of Taking Deposition Duces Tecum of David B. Shaw* (“*Shaw Notice*”) on the following bases:

1. On May 13, 2021, SVGWD filed its *Motion for Order Authorizing Discovery* asking the Director to authorize discovery in this matter. On May 21, 2021, the Director issued *Order Authorizing Discovery* (“*Discovery Order*”) allowing discovery in this matter, pursuant to Rule 521, Rule 520.01a, 520.01b, and 520.01d of the Rules of Procedure of IDWR.
2. The *Discovery Order* authorized discovery pursuant to the Idaho Rules of Civil Procedure (“IRCP”) unless otherwise limited by the *Order*.
3. The Director issued a *Prehearing Order; Scheduling Order* (“*Order*”) on May 25, requiring the parties to identify expert witnesses by May 26, and fact witnesses by May 28. *Order*, p. 5. The *Scheduling Order* provided that “If the Outside Bellevue Triangle Water Users identify an expert witness, they must also submit an explanation of what their expert witness intends to testify about.” *Id.* No similar requirement was imposed on parties in the Bellevue Triangle.
4. Mr. Shaw was listed as an expert for SVGWD and Galena in *South Valley Ground Water District and Galena Ground Water District’s Expert Witness Disclosure*, filed May 26, 2021.

5. The IRCP provides for the scope of discovery for a testifying expert. *See* IRCP 26(b)(4).
6. Under IRCP 26, an expert must disclose: (1) a complete statement of all opinions to be expressed and the basis and reasons for the opinion must be disclosed; (2) the data or other information considered by the witness in forming the opinions; (3) any exhibits to be used as a summary of or support for the opinions; (4) any qualifications of the witness, including a list of all publications authored by the witness within the preceding ten years; (5) the compensation to be paid for the testimony; and (6) a listing of any other cases in which the witness has testified as an expert at trial or by deposition within the preceding four years. IRCP 26(b)(4)(A)(i).
7. Further, IRCP excludes from discovery documents and tangible things prepared in anticipation of litigation or trial, or as here, a hearing. IRCP 26(b)(3).
8. The *Shaw Notice* attached an extensive demand for documentation that Mr. Shaw should to bring to the deposition, including an expert report, as well as an extensive and onerous list of documents that extends far beyond the scope of discovery of testifying experts authorized in Rule 26(b)(4)(A)(i).
9. Even if the parties had not reached such an agreement, the *Shaw Notice* requests documents outside the scope of expert discovery. The following is a non-exhaustive, representative list of requests exceeding the allowable scope of expert discovery:
  - a. “All written reports for this proceeding prepared by you or at your direction.” Ex. A of *Shaw Notice* at ¶ 1. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents.

- b. “All writings setting forth or describing the nature and scope of your assignment in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 4. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- c. “All writings setting forth or describing any limitation on the nature and scope of your assignment in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 5. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- d. “All writings showing exactly how you spent your time in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 10. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- e. “All written results of tests conducted by you in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 11. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- f. “All writings showing or listing the raw data, including test protocols resulting from any test performed by you or at your direction in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 14. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- g. “All writings analyzing the raw data resulting from any test performed by you or at your direction in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 13. This requests documents protected as trial preparation documents, and/or protected by attorney client privilege.
- h. “All writings setting forth the reasons or reasoning for each of the opinions and conclusions you will be giving at trial in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 13. “All writings showing each assumption you made in forming the opinions and conclusions you will be giving at the trial in this proceeding.” *Id.* at ¶ 24. While discovery of opinions is allowed, the expert’s thought process and reasoning in reaching those opinions is not, and is protected by IRCP.

10. The scope of the *Shaw Notice* greatly exceeds that allowed by the Director’s *Scheduling Order* and the IRCP. As such, SVGWD and Galena GWD object to the scope of the *Shaw Notice*.

11. Mr. Shaw will testify about the following matters, in conformity with the requirements of the Director and IRCP 26(b)(4)(A)(i).:

- a. A statement of opinions;
- b. The data considered in reaching the opinions;
- c. Summary exhibits supporting the opinions, if any;
- d. Mr. Shaw's qualifications as a witness;
- e. Mr. Shaw's compensation;
- f. A list of other testimony at trial or deposition in the prior four (4) years.

12. Mr. Shaw's trial preparation materials are not discoverable and will not be produced.

Dated this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of June, 2021.

BARKER ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP

/s/ ALBERT BARKER  
Albert P. Barker  
*Attorney for South Valley Ground Water District*

LAWSON LASKI CLARK, PLLC

By: /s/ Heather E. O'Leary  
Heather E. O'Leary  
Attorneys for Galena Ground Water District

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of June, 2021, the foregoing was filed, served, and copied as shown below.

**IDAHO DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES**  
P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720-0098

U. S. Mail  
 Hand Delivered  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

**Gary L. Spackman**  
Director  
IDAHO DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES  
PO Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720-0098

U. S. Mail  
 Hand Delivered  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

**Sarah A. Klahn**  
SOMACH SIMMONS & DUNN  
2033 11th St., #5  
Boulder, CO 80302

U. S. Mail  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

**Candice McHugh**  
**Chris Bromley**  
MCHUGH BROMLEY, PLLC  
Attorneys at Law  
380 S. 4th St., Ste. 103  
Boise, ID 83702

U. S. Mail  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

**Heather O'Leary**  
LAWSON LASKI CLARK PLLC  
PO Box 3310  
Ketchum, ID 83340

U. S. Mail  
 Overnight Mail  
 Fax  
 E-mail

**Matthew A. Johnson**  
**Brian T. O'Bannon**  
WHITE, PETERSON, GIGRAY & NICHOLS, P.A.  
5700 East Franklin Road, Suite 200  
Nampa, ID 83687-7901

U. S. Mail  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

**W. Kent Fletcher**  
FLETCHER LAW OFFICE  
P.O. Box 248  
Burley, ID 83318

U. S. Mail  
 Overnight Mail  
 E-mail

<b>Laird B. Stone</b> Stephan, Kvanvig, Stone & Trainor P.O. Box 83 Twin Falls, ID 83303-0083	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Norman M. Semanko</b> PARSONS BEHLE & LATIMER 800 West Main Street, Suite 1300 Boise, ID 83702	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Randall C. Budge</b> <b>Thomas J. Budge</b> RACINE OLSON, PLLP P.O. Box 1391 Pocatello, ID 83204	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Rusty Kramer</b> Water District 37B Groundwater Association P.O. Box 507 Fairfield, ID 83327	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Jerry R. Rigby</b> RIGBY, ANDRUS & RIGBY 25 North Second East Rexburg, ID 83440	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Joseph F. James</b> <b>Brendan L. Ash</b> James Law Office, PLLC 125 5 <sup>th</sup> Ave. West Gooding, ID 83330	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>Robert L. Harris</b> HOLDEN, KIDWELL, HAHN & CRAPO PLLC P.O. Box 50130 Idaho Falls, ID 83405	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
<b>James P. Speck</b> Speck & Aanestad P.O. Box 987 Ketchum, ID 83340	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
Richard T. Roats Lincoln County Prosecuting Attorney P.O. Box 860 Shoshone, ID 83352	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail

Paul Bennett 114 Calypso Lane Bellevue, ID 83313	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
J. Evan Robertson Gary D. Slette Robertson & Slette, PLLC P.O. Box 1906 Twin Falls, ID 83303-1906	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
Ann Y. Vonde P.O. Box 83720 Boise, ID 83720-0010	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
John K. Simpson Barker Rosholt & Simpson LLP P.O. Box 2139 Boise, ID 83701-2139	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
Lawrence Schoen Napisunaih 18351 U.S. Highway 20 Bellevue, ID 83313	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
Idaho Ranch Hands Property Management 218 Meadowbrook Hailey, ID 83333	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail
Southern Comfort Homeowner's Association P.O. Box 2739 Ketchum, ID 83340	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Hand Delivered Overnight Mail
Michael C. Creamer Michael P. Lawrence Charlie S. Baser Givens Pursley LLP P.O. Box 2720 Boise, ID 83701-2720	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	U. S. Mail Overnight Mail E-mail

/s/ Albert P. Barker  
Albert P. Barker