

RECEIVED

MAR 02 2009

DEPARTMENT OF  
WATER RESOURCES

J. Dee May, ISB # 1766  
J. Justin May, ISB # 5818  
MAY, SUDWEEKS & BROWNING, LLP  
1419 W. Washington  
Boise, Idaho 83702  
Phone: (208) 429-0905  
Fax: (208) 342-7278  
Attorneys for Rangen, Inc.

**BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES  
OF THE STATE OF IDAHO**

IN THE MATTER OF THE SECOND  
MITIGATION PLAN OF NORTH  
SNAKE GROUND WATER DISTRICT  
AND MAGIC VALLEY GROUND  
WATER DISTRICT PROVIDING FOR  
MONETARY COMPENSATION

**RANGEN, INC.'S  
MEMORANDUM IN RESPONSE  
TO ORDER ON STATUS  
CONFERENCE AND  
PROVIDING BRIEFING  
SCHEDULE ON SECOND  
MITIGATION PLAN FOR  
MONETARY COMPENSATION**

COMES NOW Rangen, Inc., and submits this Memorandum pursuant to the Director's February 20, 2009 Order on Status Conference and providing briefing schedule on Second Mitigation Plan for Monetary Compensation.

**INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND**

On February 19, 2009, in response to the Ground Water District's withdrawal of their Amended Mitigation Plan dated September 5, 2008, and their original Mitigation Plan dated June 13, 2008, the Director held a telephonic Status Conference with regard to the withdrawal. Following that Status Conference, on February 20, 2009, the Director

RANGEN, INC.'S MEMORANDUM IN RESPONSE TO ORDER ON STATUS CONFERENCE AND PROVIDING BRIEFING SCHEDULE ON SECOND MITIGATION PLAN FOR MONETARY COMPENSATION - 1

issued an Order inviting simultaneous briefing “on the issue of the Director’s authority to approve a mitigation plan providing for monetary compensation as an alternative to replacement water supplies in response to a delivery call without approval of the holder of the calling right.”

On February 23, 2009, Rangen, Inc. timely filed a protest to the Ground Water Districts’s Second Mitigation Plan of North Snake Ground Water District and Magic Valley Ground Water District providing for Monetary Compensation (“Second Mitigation Plan”).

This Brief is submitted in response to the issue identified by the Director in the February 20, 2009, Order. Rangen reserves the right to submit additional argument on other issues related to the Ground Water District’s Second Mitigation Plan including those raised in Rangen’s Protest.

### **ARGUMENT**

The Second Mitigation Plan proposes to provide monetary compensation to Clear Springs, one of the senior spring water users that is currently short of water. Under the Ground Water District’s proposal in their Second Mitigation Plan, the junior ground water users would continue to pump, depleting the aquifer and further reducing spring flows for Clear Springs as well as other water rights holders such as Rangen. The Director has a duty to distribute water in accordance with priority and does not have the authority to impose such a mitigation plan upon Clear Springs or other water rights holders. The Director cannot force senior water rights holders to accept a mitigation plan without a finding that the mitigation plan will not injure other water rights holders.

#### **I. The Director has a duty to distribute water in accordance with priority.**

The Director has an affirmative duty to distribute water in accordance with priority. *Doctrine Idaho Code § 42-602*. The statement of legal authority for the

Conjunction Management Rules provides “the Director of the Department of Water Resources is authorized to adopt rules and regulations for the distribution of water from streams, rivers, lakes, ground water, and other natural water sources as shall be necessary to carry out the laws in accordance with the priorities of the rights of the users thereof.” *IDAPA 37.03.11.000.*

**II. The Director does not have the authority to approve a mitigation plan without a finding that the plan will not injure other water rights.**

Rule 43.02 of the Conjunctive Management Rules provides “upon receipt of a proposed mitigation plan the Director will provide notice, hold a hearing as determined necessary, and consider the plan under the Procedural Provisions of section 42-222, Idaho Code, in the same manner as applications to transfer water rights.” *IDAPA 37.03.11.043.02.* Idaho Code § 42-222 provides that “the Director of the Department of Water Resources shall examine all of the evidence and available information and shall approve the change in whole, or in part, or upon conditions, *provided no other water rights are injured thereby. . .*” Idaho Code § 42-222. The Director does not have the authority to approve, and thereby impose upon a senior water right user, a mitigation plan that does not address the depletionary effect of junior ground water pumping.

The Ground Water District’s Second Mitigation Plan does nothing to address the depletionary effect of junior ground water pumping. The Second Mitigation Plan offers nothing more than compensation to Clear Springs for the taking of its water rights. In light of the Director’s duty to distribute water in priority and the mandate of Idaho Code § 42-222 that no other water rights are injured, the Director does not have the authority either to force Clear Springs to accept compensation or to approve a plan that allows for continued pumping to the detriment of other water rights holders including Rangen.

**III. The Second Mitigation Plan simply asks the Director to approve a taking of Clear Springs' water rights and establishes compensation for the taking.**

Approval of the Second Mitigation Plan would amount to a taking of Clear Springs' water rights with the Director establishing the amount of compensation/damages. The Director's approval of the Second Mitigation Plan allowing for continued pumping by junior ground water users would also be a taking of the water rights of other affected senior water rights holders. The Director does not have the authority to approve the taking of Clear Springs' water rights with or without the payment of compensation/damages. Simply put, the Director does not have the authority to establish a price and force Clear Springs, or any other water rights holder to give up its rights at that price.

**CONCLUSION**

Pursuant to the conjunctive management rules, the Director has the authority to approve a mitigation plan that addresses and mitigates the depletions caused by the actions of a junior water right holder and does not injure other water rights. The Director may also accept a settlement between parties as a resolution with regard to the parties to such an agreement. The Director does not have the authority to force the acceptance of compensation of any kind as part of a plan that does not address the depletionary effects of the junior's use of water or injures other water rights users.

Dated this 2 day of March, 2009.

MAY, SUDWEEKS & BROWNING, LLP

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
J. Justin May  
Attorneys for Rangen, Inc.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 2 day of March, 2009, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing by delivering it to the following individuals by the method indicated below, addressed as stated.

Davis R. Tuthill, Director  
Idaho Department of Water Resources  
322 E. Front Street  
P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720  
[dave.tuthill@idwr.idaho.gov](mailto:dave.tuthill@idwr.idaho.gov)  
[phil.rassier@idwr.idaho.gov](mailto:phil.rassier@idwr.idaho.gov)

\_\_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Facsimile  
\_\_\_\_\_ Overnight Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

Randall C. Budge, Esq.  
Candice M. McHugh, Esq.  
Racine, Olson, Nye, Budge & Bailey  
201 East Center, Suite A2  
P.O.Box 1391  
Pocatello, ID 83204-1391  
[rcb@racinelaw.net](mailto:rcb@racinelaw.net)  
[cmm@racinelaw.net](mailto:cmm@racinelaw.net)

\_\_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Facsimile  
\_\_\_\_\_ Overnight Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

John K. Simpson  
Travis L. Thompson  
Paul L. Arrington  
Barker, Rosholt & Simpson, LLP  
1010 W. Jefferson, Suite 102  
P.O. Box 2139  
Boise, ID 83701-2139  
[jks@idahowaters.com](mailto:jks@idahowaters.com)  
[flt@idahowaters.com](mailto:flt@idahowaters.com)  
[pla@idahowaters.com](mailto:pla@idahowaters.com)

\_\_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Facsimile  
\_\_\_\_\_ Overnight Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

Daniel V. Steenson  
Charles L. Honsinger  
S. Bryce Farris  
Ringert Clark, Chartered  
P.O. Box 2773  
Boise, ID 83701-2773  
[dvs@ringertclark.com](mailto:dvs@ringertclark.com)  
[clh@ringertclark.com](mailto:clh@ringertclark.com)

\_\_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Facsimile  
\_\_\_\_\_ Overnight Mail  
\_\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

Tracy Harr, President  
Clear Lake Country Club  
403 Clear Lake Lane  
Buhl, ID 83316

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

Stephen P. Kaatz, Vice President  
Clear Lake Homeowners Assoc  
223 Clear Lake Lane  
Buhl, ID 83316

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

Allen Merritt  
Cindy Yenter  
Watermaster – WD 130  
IDWR – Southern Region  
1341 Fillmore Street Suite 200  
Twin Falls, ID 83301-3380

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-mail

North Snake Ground Water District  
1092 South 2500 East  
Hazelton, ID 83335

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

Magic Valley Ground Water District  
P.O. Box 430  
Paul, ID 83347

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

John W. Jones, Jr.  
Thousand Springs Water Users  
P.O. Box 178  
Hagerman, ID 83332

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

W. Kent Fletcher  
Fletcher Law Office  
P.O. Box 248  
Burley, ID 83319  
wkf@pmt.org

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

C. Thomas Arkoosh  
Capitol Law Group, PLLC  
Gooding, ID 83330  
tarkoosh@capitolawgroup.net

U.S. Mail  
 Facsimile  
 Overnight Mail  
 Hand Delivery  
 E-Mail

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
J. Justin May